IDENTITY, CITIZENSHIP AND EUrope

A pie in the sky or cosmopolitanism in the making?

Challenges to EU politics

Nora Siklodi

Email: Nora.Siklodi@port.ac.uk
What does citizenship mean to you?

How about EU citizenship?

How you considered yourself an EU citizen before?
Familiarity with the term 'citizen of the European Union', 2002-2012

- No, you have never heard the term 'citizen of the European Union'
- Yes, you have heard about it, but you are not sure what it means
- Yes, and you know what it means

1. This survey is about European Union citizenship. Are you familiar with the term "citizen of the European Union"?
Do you feel citizen of the EU?
Ok, let’s take a step back...

• **What is citizenship?**
  - Dynamic bond between a sovereign political community and the individuals within it (Isin and Turner, 2002)
  - “a cluster of meanings [dimensions] related to a defined legal or social status, a means of political identity, a focus of loyalty, a requirement of duties [and] an expectation of rights” (Heater, 2004a: 166)
    → different type of bond across communities

• **What is the purpose of citizenship?**
  - To shape community-building processes, incl. processes of differentiation and exclusion (Marshall, 1950)
    - Categories of citizens: active/passive citizens and non-citizens (Turner, 1997)
Who is an EU Citizen?

- Any person who holds the nationality of an EU country is automatically also an EU citizen.
- Each EU country lays down the conditions for the acquisition and loss of nationality of that country.
- Citizenship of the Union is conferred directly on every EU citizen by the Treaty on the Functioning of the EU.
- ECJ: EU citizenship = the fundamental status of MS nationals and cannot be lost – Brexit?

Article 20 TFEU

Citizenship of the Union is hereby established. Every person holding the nationality of a Member State shall be a citizen of the Union. Citizenship of the Union shall be additional to and not replace national citizenship.
Rights of Union Citizens

Art 9 TEU: guarantees the equality of citizens, nationality principle and complimentary nature

Arts 18-25 TFEU: Arts on non-discrimination and citizenship of the Union

The provisions of Arts 21-25 primarily determine the substance of EU Citizenship.

In particular, EU citizens have the right:

1. to move and reside freely within the EU
2. to vote and stand as candidates in municipal and European Parliament elections wherever they live in the EU, under the same conditions as nationals
3. to be assisted by another EU country’s embassy or consulate outside the EU under the same conditions as a citizen of that country, if their own country is not represented
4. to petition the European Parliament, apply to the European Ombudsman and address the EU institutions (in any official EU language) and
5. to organize or support, together with other EU citizens, a citizens’ initiative to call for new EU legislation
6. not to be discriminated against on the grounds of nationality (Art. 18TFEU).
Directive 2004/38/EC


It regulates:

• the conditions in which Union citizens and their families to exercise their FoM rights
• the right of permanent residence;
• restrictions on FoM rights on grounds of public policy, public security or public health.
What is EU citizenship?
The EU’s perspective I

European Commission (1993-2013): Report(s) on citizenship of the Union (every 4 yrs)

• Source of legitimation of the process of European integration
• Participation of citizens in EU politics
• Citizens’ sense of belonging to the European Union and of having a genuine European identity
• *Sui generis* and cannot be compared to national citizenships
• *Superimposed* on member state citizens
• With practical significance for the *many* nationals, who exercise their freedom of movement
• First example of transnational citizenship
Purpose of EU citizenship

Art. 1, TEU:
“to create an ever-closer union among the peoples of Europe”
THE PERFECT EUROPEAN

SHOULD BE:

LIKE A BRIT
AVAILABLE
LIKE A BELGIAN
TALKATIVE AS A FINN
HUMOROUS AS A GERMAN
FLEXIBLE AS A SWEDEN
FAMOUS AS A LUXEMBOURGER
SOBER AS THE IRISH
HUMBLE AS A SPANIARD
GENEROUS AS A DUTCHMAN
ORGANIZED AS A GREEK
TECHNICAL AS A PORTUGUESE
CONTROLLED AS AN ITALIAN
DISCREET AS A DANE
What is EU citizenship?
Academic perspectives

Question the genuine significance and potentials of EU citizenship

• Challenges member state citizenships - identity, rights and participation (Bauböck, 2005)
• Second order citizenship (Delanty, 2007; Bellamy, 2008)
• “[A] catalogue of citizenship rights [that] is exceedingly limited” (Shaw, 1998: 246)
• Constituent of post/supranational citizenship? (Weiner, 1998; Kostakopoulou, 2007)
• A cosmopolitan model? (Habermas, 1996, 1998)
• Important distinctions between mobiles/stayers’ EU citizenship? - BUT inconsistent results
What is EUropean identity?

Do you feel EUropean/ do you have a sense of EUropean identity?
Describe.
Q04. In your opinion, among the following issues, which are those that most create a feeling of community among EU citizens?

- Culture: 27% (EB83 Sp.2015), 30% (EU28)
- Economy: 22% (EB83 Sp.2015), 24% (EU28)
- History: 21% (EB83 Sp.2015), 23% (EU28)
- Values: 19% (EB83 Sp.2015), 19% (EU28)
- Sports: 19% (EB83 Sp.2015), 19% (EU28)
- Geography: 18% (EB83 Sp.2015), 18% (EU28)
- The Rule of Law: 18% (EB83 Sp.2015), 18% (EU28)
- Solidarity with poorer regions: 14% (EB83 Sp.2015), 15% (EU28)
- Languages: 15% (EB83 Sp.2015), 15% (EU28)
- Healthcare, education and pensions: 13% (EB83 Sp.2015), 15% (EU28)
- Inventions, science and technology: 12% (EB83 Sp.2015), 12% (EU28)
- Religion: 9% (EB83 Sp.2015), 8% (EU28)
- Other (SPONTANEOUS): 1% (EB83 Sp.2015), 1% (EU28)
- None, such a feeling does not exist (SPONTANEOUS): 3% (EB83 Sp.2015), 4% (EU28)
- None (SPONTANEOUS): 2% (EB83 Sp.2015), 3% (EU28)
- Don't know: 5% (EB83 Sp.2015), 5% (EU28)

Note: The data for EB82 Aut.2014 is not visible in the image.
So the actual ‘European’ is more like...
Contemporary European identity/ies

• Multiple identities in EUnope (Herrmann and Brewer, 2004: 8-10)
  • Separate multiple identities (independent)
  • Nested multiple identities (hierarchical)
  • Cross-cutting multiple identities (multiple membership)
  • Multilayered (or marble cake) multiple identities (blended)
• Ethnic (European, national) and/or civic (EU) identity (Bruter, 2005)
• EU identity promotion
  • Internal/external (e.g. symbols/EU normative power and positive self-images)
  • Top down/bottom up (e.g. culture/ citizen participation in the EU)
EU identity promotion I: Top-down approaches

Focus on the role of symbols and culture

Symbols of EU identity

9 May
Europe Day

Ode to Joy
EU Anthem

Unity in diversity
EU motto

DANTE ALIGHIERI
Poet (1265-1321)
Argued that political unity in Europe was solution to war

DESIDERIUS ERASMUS
Theologian (1466-1536)
Saw the world as “one common fatherland”

IMMANUEL KANT
Philosopher (1724-1804)
Thought federalism was only guarantee of “perpetual peace”

VICTOR HUGO
Poet, writer (1802-1885)
Wanted to see the “États-Unis d’Europe”

VACLAV HAVEL
First President of Czech Republic (1993-2003)
Pro-EU stance encouraged eastern Europeans to join the EU

WINSTON CHURCHILL
Prime minister of UK (1940-45, 1951-55)
Called for a “United States of Europe”

PABLO PICASSO
Painter, sculptor (1881-1973)
Supporter of the Pan-European Movement

SIGMUND FREUD
Neurologist (1856-1939)
Attended the first Pan-Europa Congress in 1926
Q.5. In the following list, which values best represent the EU? % EU

- Peace
- Human rights
- Democracy
- Individual freedom
- The Rule of Law

Q13.4. This symbol is the European flag. I have a list of statements concerning it. I would like to have your opinion on each of these. For each of them, could you please tell me if you tend to agree or tend to disagree?

This flag should be seen on all public buildings in (OUR COUNTRY) next to the national flag

- 13% Tend to agree
- 9% Tend to disagree
- 0% Don't know

Other statements and results are also shown in the chart.
EU identity promotion II: Bottom-up approaches

Focus on citizens’ participation and involvement in the EU

What would strengthen your sense of EU identity?
EU27, 2012

- Common social welfare system (healthcare, education, pensions): 37%
- Free movement of pension: 24%
- EU emergency response service for natural disasters: 19%
- EU ID cards: 18%
- EU-wide mobile network at same price: 18%
- Directly elected President of the EU: 17%
But *what* participation?

- Only 2% FoM of EU population (Eurostat, 2015)
Relevance of EUropean citizenship and identity today

Depends on (perceived) objective of the EU

• Family of nations (Churchill)
• Constitutional patriotism (Habermas)
• Space for transactions between people (Deutsch)

And its future

• Political union (EU Commission): EU citizenship to EU political union = Euro to Monetary union
• Links to support for the EU project: From ‘permissive consenus’ to ‘constraining dissensus’? (Hooghe and Marks, 2005)
• Requires EU political identity (Bellamy, 2008)
• Further enlargement – Ukraine, Turkey

Russia = not EUropean?

United Kingdom: associate EU citizenship for Brits?
A couple of follow-up questions

• To what extent are EUropean citizenship and identity relevant to our understanding of EU politics today?

• Should we and if so, how can we enhance and promote EUropean citizenship and identity?